

Brazil:

Research Notebook for Colombia

CATEGORY: COUNTRY STRATEGY

Q1. Does Brazil publish the country strategy paper for Colombia?

No Partially Yes

Brazil does not have a publicly available country strategy paper for Colombia. There is a country strategy process – which is defined through a bilateral commission held every two years between each of its partner countries - but this also is not made publicly available.¹

Q2. What are the main modalities used in Brazil's operations in Colombia?

Brazil's approach to develop cooperation is grounded in the principles of South-South cooperation.² Based on this premise, the Brazilian model of cooperation is characterized by a concerted dialogue between national counterparts, characterized in terms of "horizontal cooperation."³ This approach encompasses, *inter alia*, the transfer of knowledge, capacity building, use of local labor force, and a focus on the provision of other forms of technical cooperation rather than financial aid.⁴ The rationale behind this approach is to develop national ownership and avoid creating dependency on international aid.⁵ An additional impetus is the difficulty of justifying to Brazilian citizens the provision of aid to another country as long domestically Brazil has its own development needs to meet.

Within the Ministry of Foreign Relations of Brazil, the Brazilian Agency of Cooperation (ABC) is responsible for the negotiation, coordination, implementation and monitoring of technical cooperation projects. Given these functions, the ministry, in theory, centralizes the process of development cooperation through its embassy in Colombia.⁶ Nonetheless, regardless of these official responsibilities, the Brazilian model of cooperation is relatively decentralized.⁷ At the national, state and municipal levels, different Brazilian governmental institutions are allowed to develop technical cooperation with other countries and their sub-national institutions. In line with these characteristics, Brazilian development cooperation is coordinated through both the Colombian central government and other sub-national institutions such as Medellin's agency for development.⁸

Q3. Does Brazil have a policy/protocol on mutual accountability?

No Partially Yes

The Basic Agreement on Technical Cooperation between Brazil and Colombia was signed in 1972 and constitutes the founding document for the two countries' technical cooperation.⁹ Since 2005, this agreement has been supplemented by additional accords that reflect new cooperation projects.¹⁰ In addition, since 2009 a Bilateral Commission on Cooperation is held every two years to undertake a joint

¹ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, Colombia, 13 March 2012. Brazil Agency of Cooperation (ABC) website: <http://www.abc.gov.br>.

² Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, Colombia, 13 March 2012.

³ "Cooperação técnica," Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Itamaraty), <http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/temas/cooperacao-tecnica>. Accessed on 12 November 2012.

⁴ See Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Relations website <http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/temas/cooperacao-tecnica>. The Ministry of Foreign Relations is commonly referred as "Itamaraty".

⁵ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, 13 March 2012.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ "Cooperacao Brasileira para o Desenvolvimento Internacional: 2005-2009."

⁸ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, 13 March 2012.

⁹ Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, http://dai-mre.serpro.gov.br/atos-internacionais/bilaterais/1972/b_120.

¹⁰ Brazilian Minister of Foreign Affairs website, "Atos internacionais" (<http://dai-mre.serpro.gov.br/>).

assessment of previous and on-going projects.¹¹ In spite of these new developments, Brazilian government officials reiterate the principle of mutual accountability and the importance that both countries learn from the cooperation process.¹²

Q4. How are mutual accountability protocols determined and upheld with Colombia?

The Bilateral Commission on Cooperation represents the formal mechanism for ensuring mutual accountability. Drawing from the Brazilian principles of South-South cooperation, there are no enforcement mechanisms embedded in the process but rather this is done de facto through a jointly conducted assessment in the Bilateral Commission framework. After each official bilateral meeting, a technical report is formulated identifying different areas of mutual interest for cooperation and summarizing meeting discussion. This document can be provided upon formal request to the Brazilian government but is not available online.¹³ As a result, it is not possible to determine if these protocols are put into practice and upheld.

CATEGORY: DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION POLICIES

Q5. Does Brazil publish allocation policies and procedures for development cooperation?

No Partially Yes

Brazilian aid policies and procedures are generally available online and upon request. The ABC website provides an organizational chart of its operational structure, a list of multilateral and bilateral cooperation agreements, as well as guidance documents for project formulation and technical cooperation.¹⁴ In addition, complementary agreements to the Basic Agreement on Technical Cooperation of 1972 describe terms of cooperation with Colombia, including the transfer of financial resources and the use of resources from public or private institutions.¹⁵ In terms of cooperation between Brazilian and Colombian municipalities, these procedures and policies tend to be more flexible and vary according to local governments. According to the Bogota Mayor's Office, while the government of Sao Paulo uses formal channels through ABC, the government of Curitiba has carried out direct technical cooperation with the city.¹⁶

Q6. Does Brazil use participatory mechanisms to involve local/national stakeholders?

No Partially Yes

At the national level, Brazil assumes that these institutions represent the Colombian population's interests as the government has been elected through a democratic process.¹⁷ In this sense, no participatory mechanisms have been officially implemented which aim to involve other actors, including from the civil society. However, the involvement of Brazilian and Colombian municipal-level institutions in technical cooperation projects does suggest that there is a more localized, participatory approach used for developing and implementing projects. Still, it seems that accountability remains oriented toward the partner government institution.

¹¹ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, Colombia, 13 March 2012.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Brazil Agency of Cooperation (ABC) website: <http://www.abc.gov.br>.

¹⁵ Brazilian Minister of Foreign Affairs website, "Atos internacionais" (<http://dai-mre.serpro.gov.br/>). Accessed on 12 November 2012.

¹⁶ Interview, Bogota Mayor's Office representatives, Bogota, Colombia, 20 March 2012.

¹⁷ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, Colombia, 13 March 2012.

Q6a. Does Colombia use participatory mechanisms to involve local/national stakeholders?

No Partially Yes

Through the National Cooperation System, the Colombian Presidential Cooperation Agency (APC) involves sub-national governments in the decision-process regarding development cooperation projects.¹⁸ In practice, this strategy varies significantly according to local capacities: only some departments and municipalities such as Medellin have strong expertise on international cooperation, which facilitates coordination with the Colombian central government. APC tries to identify one representative at the departmental and municipal level with the objective of compiling information in relation to priorities and needs in the regions.

CATEGORY: BUDGETARY PLANNING

Q7. How much total ODA was effectively disbursed in calendar year 2011 for Colombia?

The Brazilian Agency of Cooperation maintains a public database of its projects on its website. As of November 2012, it lists 44 multilateral and bilateral projects in Colombia (South-South and trilateral cooperation) but only contains basic information on the projects and lacks information on the amount of resources involved in each project among other important details.¹⁹ Consequently, detailed information on the amount of cooperation disbursed by Brazil to Colombia in 2011 could not be found on the government's website.²⁰ Still, third party websites have drawn together a picture of Brazil's cooperation to Colombia. AidData (www.aiddata.org) compiled raw data of Brazil's South-South Cooperation from 2005-2011 based on ABC statistics. It reports that the total amount of technical and financial cooperation provided to Colombia in 2011 is reported at US\$ 542,866.²¹

Q8. Does Brazil publish forward planning budget or documents for the institutions they fund for the next three years?

No Partially Yes

There is no publicly available forward planning budget or documents for Brazil's intended funding recipients in Colombia. Any predetermined project or national-level amounts may be discussed in bilateral discussions, but the amount of committed resources is not made readily available to the public. For example, Brazilian and Colombian officials held meetings in October 2011 to define the 2011-2013 cooperation agenda, and identified areas of common interest for cooperation without releasing any forward planning budgets.²²

CATEGORY: MONITORING & EVALUATION

Q9. Does Brazil monitor and evaluate the implementation of operations?

No Partially Yes

¹⁸ Interview: Carolina Hernandez (APC), Bogota, Colombia, 14 March 2012.

¹⁹ "Pesquisa de Projetos," Ministério das Relações Exteriores, Agência Brasileira de Cooperação (ABC): <http://www.abc.gov.br/>.

²⁰ On 19 March 2012, a formal request for information was sent to the Brazilian Agency of Cooperation (ABC) headquarters asking how much aid it delivers in Colombia. As of May 2012, no information had been provided. The ABC website does not list specific project amounts: <http://www.abc.gov.br>. Accessed on 12 November 2012.

²¹ Aiddata database, Brazil's South-South Cooperation, 2005-2011, <http://www.aiddata.org/content/index/AidData-Raw/other-donor-datasets>. Accessed on 12 November 2012.

²² See: VII Reunión del Grupo de Trabajo de Cooperación Técnica entre la Republica Federativa del Brasil y la Republica de Colombia (Brasilia – Brasil, 3 octubre de 2011). <http://www.cancilleria.gov.co/international/regions/americas/south/brazil>.

All projects are supposed to be evaluated at the mid-point and final stages. The Brazilian government develops a general assessment based on ad hoc consultations between the Brazilian embassy and Colombian officials. In this sense, the Brazilian model of cooperation seems to lack a systematic process of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) at the project level. Brazilian officials explained this absence of a clear M&E process based in part on the small cost and scale of the projects. As a result, there is a relatively high cost and low benefit for conducting more rigorous accountability checks.²³ At the national level, the assessment produced by the Bilateral Commission on Cooperation aims to establish an M&E mechanism but in practice it seems that there is still no comprehensive, systematized M&E structure. More broadly there is a system-wide financial monitoring of projects (O Sistema de Informações Gerenciais de Acompanhamento de Projetos - SIGAP) although this information is not public.²⁴

Q10. Does Brazil publish the evaluations of its aid programs?

No Partially Yes

The results of the Brazilian projects evaluations are not publicly available.²⁵

Q11. How are disagreements dealt with between Brazil and Colombia?

Any disagreement would theoretically be dealt with using the framework of the Bilateral Commission on Cooperation. Brazilian officials noted that the country's model of cooperation attends to Colombian priorities, and therefore downplayed the occurrence of disagreements.²⁶

²³ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, Colombia, 13 March 2012.

²⁴ See: <http://www.abc.gov.br/sigap/default.aspx>.

²⁵ Brazil Agency of Cooperation (ABC) website: <http://www.abc.gov.br/>.

²⁶ Interview: Joao Ernesto Cristofolo, Brazilian Embassy in Bogota, Colombia, 13 March 2012.